



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE

United States Patent and Trademark Office

Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS

P.O. Box 1450

Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450

www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/645,373	08/21/2003	Craig D. Tipton	3202R	7486
26645 7590 11/10/2008 THE LUBRIZOL CORPORATION ATTN: DOCKET CLERK, PATENT DEPT. 29400 LAKELAND BLVD. WICKLIFFE, OH 44092				
EXAMINER				
RONESL VICKEY M				
ART UNIT		PAPER NUMBER		
1796				
MAIL DATE		DELIVERY MODE		
11/10/2008		PAPER		

**Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.**

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

***Attachment to Advisory Action***

Applicants' amendment filed 11/5/2008 has been fully considered; however, the amendment has not been entered given that it raises new issues that would require further consideration and/or search.

It is the examiner's position that the amendment contains new issues because the independent claims a combination of limitations (specifically boric acid as the borating agent and specific relative amounts of ingredients) that had not been before presented. Furthermore, dependent claims of these independent claims contain combinations of limitations not heretofore presented. Therefore, the amendment would require further consideration and/or search.

In the interest of better enabling the applicants to assess the patentability of their claims, the following advisory is given: even had the amendment been entered, the rejections would have been maintained given that the exemplified amounts are not reasonably commensurate in scope with the claimed amounts and that data is not a proper comparison to the closest prior art of Le Suer '936 which discloses and exemplifies boric acid and not long chain alkyl borates.

11/6/2008  
Vickey Ronesi

/V. R./  
Examiner, Art Unit 1796

/Vasu Jagannathan/  
Supervisory Patent Examiner, Art Unit 1796